

Anna Wolkenhauer

Universität Bremen, InIIS, room 7.2120

Mary-Somerville-Str. 7, 28359 Bremen

Tel. 0421/218-66413

Email: anna.wolkenhauer@uni-bremen.de

Office hour: Mon 14-16 (by appointment)

Winter term 2019/2020

African states since independence – ups and downs in development planning

BA Seminar, VAK-Nr. 08-26-5-M13-4

Pol-Modul 13 “Policy and Welfare State Research”

Tue, 18.00-19.30* – GW2 B1410

* we will start at 18:00 sharp!

About the seminar

Historically, states have played a major role in fostering economic and social development. In nowadays-industrialised countries, economic, agricultural, industrial and social policies provided means for states to direct investments, foster higher value added activities, and (re-)distribute national resources. The term “developmental states” was primarily coined in discussions of the East-Asian miracle states, which achieved rapid economic growth in the second half of the 20th century. Meanwhile, economic development and industrialisation lagged in Sub-Saharan Africa during that time. After an era of state-led development in the immediate post-independence period, severe budget constraints, debt crises and aid dependence necessitated a cut in public spending from the mid-1970s. States withdrew their interventions in many sectors and left development to the market. It has been shown that this led to higher levels of poverty and a shortage in basic services. Hence, the 1990s saw a return to an acknowledgement of the necessity of public spending but it remains an open question what states can do in a context of limited financial means, diverse public pressures and dependence on international financial institutions. After the first four sessions that will be dedicated to setting the scene by clarifying definitions and concepts, we will spend four sessions discussing these – broadly delineated – historical eras. Besides digging into some comparative and general literature, student presentations will add some empirical illustrations.

The latter part of the seminar will focus on present-day issues associated with state-led development. In recent years, some authors have discovered “developmental states” in Africa, such as in Ethiopia or Rwanda. In fact, the term is increasingly popular, as can be seen from the fact that three out of the selected ten highly cited articles in the journal *African Affairs* employ it ([the articles are open access and worth looking at!](#)). Before we go into a discussion of contemporary issues, we will spend a session on reflecting on changing developmental doctrines, as a way to recap the historical sessions and make us aware of the centrality of knowledge and academic research. We will also discuss how much the concept of “developmental states” really helps our imagination of transformative projects in the future. Finally, we will discuss some contemporary issues related to developmental states, such as the place for industry and agriculture. And we will look at how much space there is for states in a world of global capitalist and political interconnectedness to steer their own national development. Finally, we will hear a guest lecture on Mozambique’s development trajectory.

Assignments and grading

Students who need/want to acquire 3 CP are required to *either* give a 15-minute individual presentation in class, accompanied by a five-page written summary of it, *or* write an 8-10-page essay. For 6 CP, students are required to write *either* a 15-20-page term paper *or* two 8-10-page essays. (If the “6 CP students” wish to give presentations, that should also be possible.)

Presentations: Students who choose to give a presentation are invited to choose any of the sessions 5, 6, 7, 10, 11, or 12 and enrich the general discussion with a country case study (single case or comparative). It should be related to the topic of the session and be based on additional research. I am very happy to provide advice on possible literature. The topics of the presentations need to be chosen and agreed until the third session (i.e. 29.10.!) Presentations should take 15 minutes and provide a handout for the rest of group in addition to the five-page summary to be handed in to me. Presentations do not have to make use of power point. If you wish to, though, make sure to arrange the necessary equipment in due time. And please also ensure that you do not exceed the time limit of 15 minutes.

Term papers and essays: Term papers and essays should follow the [guidelines](#) of the Institute of Political Science and need to be submitted by 31st March 2020 (via email as a soft copy). Make sure you plan sufficient time for an office hour with me to discuss your ideas (and be aware that I will be absent for parts of February and March). If you choose (for 6 CP) to submit two essays, you are welcome to submit one of them until the end of February in order to receive feedback before you write the second one. The 15-20-page terms papers are the more classical type where you have more room for theoretical and empirical elaborations. The shorter essays would have a somewhat different structure given the scarcity of space. (All of this is described in the study guide – see link above – but I am happy to provide additional guidance.) N.B. Make sure to include all necessary information on the cover sheet! Best idea is to use the [template](#) provided by the Institute.

3 CP = *either* 15-minute presentation with 5-page written summary *or* 8-10-page essay

6 CP = *either* 15-20-page term paper *or* two 8-10-page essays

A note on reading: The success of the seminar is dependent on all participants’ active reading of the assigned literature. When reading, it sometimes helps to have guiding questions in mind, and the following can be used to focus your understanding of the literature as well as our debates in class. 1. What does “development” consist of? Which sectors does it include, how is it measured and defined? 2. What can states (i.e. governments and bureaucracies) do to foster development, and what have they done in the past (in Africa and elsewhere)? 3. What are the contemporary constraints to state-led development? 4. Are there alternatives? I have indicated in each session whether you should read all of the texts or can choose one of them – in most cases the latter. In the sessions where I have given you an option to choose one reading from two, please make extra sure to come well prepared as we will have to bring everyone on the same page about the contents of the readings. **N.B.** Not all texts are available as open source, i.e. you might need to download/access them while in campus wifi (eduroam)! So make sure you do so in good time. A few texts that are not online will be made available in this [cloud](#)!

Office hours: please do not hesitate to drop by my office during the office hours Mon 14-16 for quick chats of 5-10 minutes, but please make an appointment if you think we need more time.

Overview of the course

Part 1: What are we talking about?

Session 1, 15.10.2019: Introductory session

This session will provide a short introduction to the course and serve to familiarise ourselves with each other as well as the procedures. The syllabus and our expectations of the class will be discussed. There are no readings assigned.

Session 2, 22.10.2019: African “development” – conceptual issues and long-term trends

Readings (please read all):

- Gumede, Vusi. 2019. Rethinking and reclaiming development in Africa. In: Mpofu, Busani, and Sabelo J. Ndlovu-Gatsheni, eds. Rethinking and Unthinking Development – Perspectives on Inequality and Poverty in South Africa and Zimbabwe. New York and Oxford: Berghan, pp. 50-70. Will be made available in the [cloud](#).
- Lawrence, Peter. 2010. The African tragedy – international and national roots. In: Padayachee, Vishnu, ed. The Political Economy of Africa. London and New York: Routledge, pp. 19-38. Will be made available in the [cloud](#).
- African Development Bank 2019. African Economic Outlook. Available online: https://www.afdb.org/fileadmin/uploads/afdb/Documents/Publications/2019AEO/AEO_2019-EN.pdf --> read only pp. 1-11.

This session is about fundamentals: how is development defined and what were the long-term trends in economic development in Africa since independence? This session is reading-heavy as we try to get a conceptual angle (Gumede), a long-term view (Lawrence) as well as a very recent overview of growth trends (ADB). The session will set the scene on development in Africa before the subsequent historical excursus to other parts of the world.

Session 3, 29.10.2019: States and markets for development – an ongoing debate

Readings (you can choose one):

- Reinert, Erik S. 2007. Chapter 2: The evolution of two different approaches. In: How rich countries got rich... and why poor countries stay poor. Public Affairs, pp. 21-70. Will be made available in the [cloud](#).
- Wade, Robert H. 1990. Introduction; and Chapter 1: States, Markets and Industrial Policy. In: Governing the market, pp. 3-33. Princeton → read chapter 1. Will be made available via [cloud](#).

The two readings are supposed to give you an introduction to the ubiquitous state-market debate in international development. Both authors (Reinert and Wade) can be termed heterodox economists, i.e. they do not share the views of neoclassical economics that often lead to “neoliberal” policies where many state functions are sourced out to market actors. Reinert’s piece is the second chapter of his very insightful and nice to read book, in which he argues that protectionist state interventions were crucial measures taken by European states before they were fully industrialised but that these are discouraged in late industrialisers, which is why the latter “stay poor”. Wade is one of the key authors studying East Asian economic growth and in the introduction and chapter 1 of his classical 1990 book he introduces

the much-debated interpretation of the “tiger states” and the underlying ways of thinking about state engagement for development. Both texts provide background and you can pick one of them (Wade’s text might be shorter but I find Reinert easier to read).

Session 4, 05.11.2019: East Asian developmental states – a model for all?

Readings (you can choose one):

- Amsden, Alice H. 1994. Why Isn’t the Whole World Experimenting with the East Asian Model to Develop?: Review of The East Asian Miracle. *World Development*, 22 (4), pp. 627-33. Available online: http://sites.utexas.edu/chinaecon/files/2015/06/Amsdem_Response-to-East-Asian-Miracle.pdf
- Chang, Ha-Joon. 2010. How to ‘do’ a developmental state: political, organisational and human resource requirements for the developmental state. In: In: Edigheji, Omano, ed. *Constructing a democratic developmental state in south africa – potentials and challenges*. Available online: <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/cpsi/unpan039020.pdf#page=11> (chapter 4)

In this session, we will read two more of the great authors on East Asian development, Alice Amsden and Ha-Joon Chang. Both pieces discuss the historical experience with an eye to their replicability. Amsden offers a critique of the World Bank’s “market-fundamentalist” reading of the East Asian success, which, so she says, fails to properly address the question of how the model can be adapted to other places and times. Chang’s is a more general recipe for how to do a developmental state (published in an edited volume on South Africa) – but likewise informed by that historical point of view.

Part 2: Historical trajectories of development planning in Africa

Session 5, 12.11.2019: Colonial rule and colonial legacies

Reading:

- Amin, Samir. 1972. Underdevelopment and dependence in Black Africa—origins and contemporary forms. *The Journal of Modern African Studies* 10.4, pp. 503-524. Available online: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/160011.pdf>

Presentation: tba

The text by Samir Amin is one of the most insightful and most cited works about colonial economic legacies in Africa. The way in which colonial powers extracted resources and re-organised labour markets and the economic structure of their dominated countries, crucially shaped the latter’s long-term integration in the world economy as well as internal set-up. This reading provides a good account of the “initial conditions” that new independent African states and governments faced.

Session 6, 19.11.2019: Post-independence era and state-led development

Reading:

- Mkandawire, Thandika. 1988. The road to crisis, adjustment and de-industrialisation: The African case. Africa Development/Afrique et Développement, pp. 5-31. Will be made available via [cloud](#).

Presentation: tba

Generally speaking, many African governments attempted some state-led development, including industrialisation, in the early years after independence. These phases were often cut short, however, Yet, there is some evidence of success and Mkandawire's text provides a good historical contextualisation of these early experiences in comparison to state-led development in other world regions. Mkandawire is a key author on African development and employs a convincing mix of historical political economy, economic and sociological perspectives. (Which is why he will return in the syllabus two more times!)

mid-term evaluation

Session 7, 26.11.2019: Structural adjustment and neoliberalism

Reading:

- Wangwe, S.M. and H.H. Semboja. 2003. Impact of Structural Adjustment on Industrialisation and Technology in Africa. Chapter 5 in: Mkandawire and Soludo, eds. African Voices on Structural Adjustment. CODESRIA, pp. 161-88. Available online: <https://idl-bnc-idrc.dspacedirect.org/bitstream/handle/10625/26709/IDL-26709.pdf?sequence=82#page=198>

Presentation: tba

After a short period in which governments had some means (and much motivation) to pursue industrialisation and agrarian change, their possibilities were reduced tremendously by the onset of the oil crisis and other economic crises of the 1970s. As a result, they needed to take up international loans which deepened the debt burden and moreover came with so-called conditionalities. The World Bank and IMF made their provision of loans conditional on the implementation of certain macro-economic reforms that were meant to reduce state interference in price systems and markets. Austerity measures, i.e. cuts in public spending, further reduced the abilities of states to direct and make investments for long-term development. The reading by Wangwe and Semboja looks particularly at the effects of these "structural adjustment" reforms on industries and technology.

Session 8, 03.12.2019: Turn to poverty reduction

Readings (you can choose one):

- Adésinà JO. 2009. Social policy in sub-Saharan Africa: a glance in the rear-view mirror. International Journal of Social Welfare, pp. 37-51. Available online: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1111/j.1468-2397.2009.00629.x>
- Fraser, Alastair. 2007. Zambia: Back to the future? GEG Working Paper No. 2007/30, University of Oxford. Available online: <https://www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/196293/1/GEG-WP-030.pdf>

Following on the "neoliberal" period (roughly 1980s and 90s), many have called the period since 2000 a turn away from merely reducing public expenditure and getting prices right, amongst other things due

to rising poverty levels as an outcome of that period. Instead, it seems, states are again more strongly engaged in development. Yet, there is a lot of concern that development has been reduced to versions of poverty reduction instead of more structurally transformative visions. In fact, a lot of attention is nowadays focussed on social protection policies, with a tendency to remedy problems created by poverty and marginalisation through individual-level interventions (such as cash transfers). Jimi Adèsinà offers a critique of that social policy discourse. The second reading is a study of Zambia, which represents a telling case of continued donor dependence and the turning towards “poverty reduction strategy papers” in the early 2000s.

Part 3: Present-day developmental states in Africa

Session 9, 10.12.2019: Economic doctrines and an alternative view

Readings (you can choose one):

- Mkandawire, Thandika. 2014. The Spread of Economic Doctrines and Policymaking in Postcolonial Africa. *African Studies Review*, Volume 57, Number 1, pp. 171-198. Available online: <https://www.cambridge.org/core/services/aop-cambridge-core/content/view/AE5F57F4011E71D9E1C36086F7000667/S0002020614000122a.pdf/the-spread-of-economic-doctrines-and-policymaking-in-postcolonial-africa.pdf>
- Radice, Hugo. 2008. The Developmental State under Global Neoliberalism. *Third World Quarterly*, 29:6, pp. 1153-1174. Available online: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/01436590802201121>

In this session, we will zoom out of the debate and reflect from a more distant perspective on, 1., how periods of policymaking in history are intertwined with periods in economic thinking (Mkandawire-text), and, 2., whether the developmental state concept is really the most innovative and transformative way to think about the future of development (Radice-text). Both are meant to provide a critical lens through which to regard the subsequent sessions on contemporary debates.

Session 10, 17.12.2019: Industrial development

Readings (you can choose one):

- Mbabazi, Pamela and Gladys Mokhawa. 2005. The Developmental State and Manufacturing in Uganda and Botswana: The Textile Industries Compared. In: Mbabazi, Pamela and Ian Taylor, eds. *The Potentiality of ‘Developmental States’ in Africa: Botswana and Uganda Compared*. CODESRIA. Available at: https://www.codesria.org/IMG/pdf/10-Mbabazi_Gladys.pdf?2373/6d6fd56aa00085578023f9e724ff2faa27bd1640
- United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA). 2016. *Transformative Industrial Policy for Africa*. Available at: https://www.uneca.org/sites/default/files/PublicationFiles/tipa-full_report_en_web.pdf (chapter 3)

Presentation: tba

This and the next session focus on two specific sectors in which states can potentially foster development: industry and agriculture. While industry is the more classical field associated with structural transformation and a move into higher value added economic activities, as well as employment opportunities, agriculture and the links between the two also play an important part.

Session 10 is based on one comparative case study on manufacturing in Uganda and Botswana; as well as chapter 3 of a 2016 UNECA report that makes clear how timely and necessary industrialisation still is.

little input on writing term papers/essays

Session 11, 07.01.2020: Agriculture and natural resources

Readings (you can choose one):

- Ikpe, Eka. 2018. The Enduring Relevance of the Developmental State Paradigm Across Space and Time: Lessons for Africa on Structural Transformation and Agriculture in Oil-Rich Contexts. *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 53.5, pp. 764-781. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0021909617722375>
- Moyo, Sam. 2010. The agrarian question and the developmental state in Southern Africa. In: Edigheji, Omano, ed. *Constructing a democratic developmental state in south africa – potentials and challenges*. Available online: <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/cpsi/unpan039020.pdf#page=11> (chapter 14)

Presentation: tba

This session explores the question of what it means for African developmental states to be set in contexts of large rural populations and a significant reliance on agriculture and natural resource extraction for the state budget. Both pieces are comparative: Moyo's is on agrarian change, and Ikpe's on developmental states in oil-rich contexts.

Session 12, 14.01.2020: The international system as a hindrance?

Reading (please read both):

- Booth, David, and Frederick Golooba-Mutebi. 2014. How the international system hinders the consolidation of developmental regimes in Africa. *Developmental Regimes in Africa Project Working Paper 4*. Will be provided in the [cloud](#).
- Ortiz, Isabel and Mathew Cummins. 2019. *Austerity: The New Normal, A Renewed Washington Consensus 2010-24*. Available online: <http://policydialogue.org/files/publications/papers/Austerity-the-New-Normal-Ortiz-Cummins-6-Oct-2019.pdf> --> read only introduction

Presentation: tba

Lastly, we will dig into a debate that takes up a large space in present-day developmental state discourse: the question of how state-led economic growth is possible within the present regime of global trade and cooperation. The paper by Booth and Golooba-Mutebi follows this question, while also providing a nice overview of the African developmental states literature at large. The introduction of Isabel Ortiz' and Mathew Cummins' (from ILO and UNICEF, respectively) very recent report adds another dimension to that topic: how to foster national development in times of austerity.

Session 13, 21.01.2010: the developmental history of Mozambique (guest lecture by Sarah Penteadó)

Readings (you can choose one):

- Hanlon, Joseph and Marcelo Mosse. 2010. Mozambique's Elite – Finding its Way in a Globalized World and Returning to Old Development Models. UNU-Wider. Available online: <http://oro.open.ac.uk/23271/1/wp2010-105%255B1%255D.pdf>
- Macamo, Elisio and Dieter Neubert. 2004. When the post-revolutionary state decentralizes: the reorganization of political structures and administration in Mozambique. *Cadernos de Estudos Africanos*, 5/6. Available online: <https://journals.openedition.org/cea/1049>

In the second-to-last session we will be joined by Sarah Penteadó, who works on social policy in Mozambique and will give us a little guest lecture on the Mozambican experience, presenting yet another very different and interesting case. She will also join us for the discussion of the readings.

Session 14, 28.01.2020: Wrap-up

Reading: tba.

We will reflect on the class and discuss open questions. Possibility to ask about the term papers and essays! We might assign another reading if something arises in the course of the seminar